

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----	X	
MELINDA SERIN, JUDSON RUSS, LONG SOU	:	
LIM, PERI KETTLER, GORDON REDNER, AND	:	
THOMAS J. SMITH,	:	
	:	
	:	
Plaintiffs,	:	
	:	
	:	06 CV 1625 (SCR)
-against-	:	
	:	
	:	
NORTHERN LEASING SYSTEMS, INC., JAY	:	
COHEN, RICH HAHN, and SARA KRIEGER,	:	
	:	
	:	
Defendant.	:	
-----	X	

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF  
DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS THE AMENDED COMPLAINT**

MOSES & SINGER LLP  
*Attorneys for Defendants*  
405 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10174  
(212) 554-7800 (telephone)  
(212) 554-7700 (facsimile)

Of Counsel:

Abraham Y. Skoff, Esq  
Robert D. Lillienstein, Esq  
Scott E. Silberfein, Esq.  
Danielle S. Friedberg, Esq.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preliminary Statement .....	1
Statement Of Facts .....	3
Argument.....	7
I. THE RULE 12(b)(6) STANDARD.....	7
II. PLAINTIFFS’ RICO CLAIMS SHOULD BE DISMISSED .....	8
A. Elements Of A RICO Claim Under Section 1962(c) .....	8
B. Plaintiffs Have Not Sufficiently Alleged Predicate Acts Of Racketeering Activity.....	8
1. The Amended Complaint Does Not Adequately Allege Mail or Wire Fraud.....	9
2. The Amended Complaint Does Not Allege Fraud With The Required Particularity As Required By Rule 9(b) .....	11
3. As this Court previously held, the filing of lawsuits – even if meritless or harassing – is not “extortion” under the Hobbs Act or New York law .....	13
C. The Alleged “Pattern” Of Racketeering Activity Lacks Either Closed-Ended Or Open-Ended Continuity .....	14
D. Plaintiffs Have Not Adequately Alleged A RICO “Enterprise” .....	17
1. The alleged “enterprise” is not distinct from the Defendants .....	17
2. The “enterprise” allegations are not sufficiently specific .....	19
E. The Statute Of Limitation Bars RICO Claims By Three Of The Plaintiffs .....	19
F. Plaintiffs’ Rico Conspiracy Claim Must Also Be Dismissed .....	21
III. PLAINTIFFS’ SECTION 349(a) CLAIM SHOULD BE DISMISSED.....	23
IV. PLAINTIFFS SHOULD NOT BE PERMITTED TO REPLEAD AGAIN .....	23
Conclusion.....	24
Conclusion.....	25

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

## FEDERAL CASES

<i>236 Cannon Realty, L.L.C., v. Ziss,</i> 2005 WL 289752 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 8, 2005) .....	9
<i>Agency Holding Corp. v. Malley-Duff &amp; Associates, Inc.,</i> 483 U.S. 143 (1987) .....	19
<i>Allen v. New World Coffee, Inc.,</i> 2001 WL 293683 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 27, 2001) .....	15, 16, 22
<i>Anatian v. Coutts Bank (Switz.) Ltd.,</i> 193 F.3d 85 (2d Cir. 1999) .....	17
<i>Appalachian Enters. v. ePayment Solutions Ltd.,</i> 2004 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 24657 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 18, 2004) .....	13
<i>Bank of China v. NBM LLC,</i> 359 F.3d 171 (2d Cir. 2004) .....	9
<i>Bennett v. United States Trust Co.,</i> 770 F.2d 308 (2d Cir. 1985) .....	17
<i>Celpaco, Inc. v. MD Papietfabriken,</i> 686 F.Supp. 983 (D. Conn. 1988) .....	11
<i>Cofacredit, S.A. v. Windsor Plumbing Supply, Co., Inc.,</i> 187 F.3d 229 (2d Cir. 1999) .....	14
<i>Cosmos v. Hassett,</i> 886 F.2d 8 (2d Cir. 1989) .....	12
<i>DeFalco v. Bernas,</i> 244 F.3d 286 (2d Cir. 2001) .....	18
<i>Denny v. Barber,</i> 576 F.2d 465 (2d Cir. 1978) .....	24
<i>DiVittorio v. Equidyne Extractive Industrial, Inc.,</i> 822 F.2d 1242 (2d Cir. 1987) .....	13
<i>In re Eaton Vance Mutual Funds Fee Litigation,</i> 403 F.Supp.2d 310 (S.D.N.Y. 2005) .....	24
<i>Efron v. Embassy Suites (Puerto Rico), Inc.,</i>	

223 F.3d 12 (1st Cir. 2000) .....	21
<i>Feinstein v. Resolution Trust Corp.</i> , 942 F.2d 34 (1st Cir. 1991) .....	13
<i>Feirstein v. Nanbar Realty Corp.</i> , 963 F.Supp. 254 (S.D.N.Y. 1997) .....	12, 15, 16
<i>First Capital Asset Management Inc. v. Satinwood, Inc.</i> , 385 F.3d 159 (2d Cir. 2004) .....	15, 17
<i>First Nationwide Bank v. Gelt Funding Corp.</i> , 820 F.Supp. 89 (S.D.N.Y. 1993), <i>aff'd</i> , 27 F.3d 763 (2d Cir. 1994) .....	19
<i>Fitzgerald v. Henderson</i> , 251 F.3d 345 (2d Cir. 2001) .....	3
<i>Frooks v. Town of Cortlandt</i> , 997 F.Supp. 438 (S.D.N.Y. 1998), <i>aff'd mem.</i> , 182 F.3d 899 (2d Cir. 1999) .....	8
<i>Gebhardt v. Allspect, Inc.</i> , 96 F.Supp. 2d 331 (S.D.N.Y. 2000) .....	7
<i>Goldman v. Belden</i> , 754 F.2d 1059 (2d Cir. 1985) .....	7
<i>Grandon v. Merrill Lynch &amp; Co.</i> , 147 F.3d 184 (2d Cir. 1998) .....	7
<i>H.J., Inc. v. Northwestern Bell Telephone Co.</i> , 492 U.S. 229 (1989) .....	14, 15
<i>Hayduk v. Lanna</i> , 775 F.2d 441 (1st Cir. 1985) .....	24
<i>Hernandez v. Ballesteros</i> , 333 F.Supp.2d 6 (D.P.R. 2004), <i>aff'd</i> , 449 F.3d 240 (1st Cir. 2006) .....	13
<i>In re Integrated Resources Real Estate, Ltd. P'ships Sec. Litigation</i> , 850 F.Supp. 1105 (S.D.N.Y. 1993) .....	8
<i>In re Sumitomo Copper Litigation</i> , 104 F.Supp.2d 314 (S.D.N.Y. 2000) .....	21
<i>Jordan (Bermuda) Investment Co., Ltd. V. Hunter Green Investments Ltd.</i> , 154 F. Supp. 2d 682 (S.D.N.Y. 2001) .....	8

<i>Katzman v. Victoria's Secret Catalogue</i> , 167 F.R.D. 649 (S.D.N.Y. 1996), <i>aff'd mem.</i> , 113 F.3d 1229 (2d Cir. 1997).....	7, 22
<i>Knoll v. Schectman</i> , 275 Fed. Appx. 50, 51 (2d Cir. 2008) .....	12
<i>Lakonia Management Ltd. v. Meriwether</i> , 106 F.Supp.2d 540 (S.D.N.Y. 2000).....	12
<i>Lightning Lube, Inc. v. Witco Corp.</i> , 4 F.3d 1153 (3d Cir. 1993).....	22
<i>McLaughlin v. Anderson</i> , 962 F.2d 187 (2d Cir. 1992).....	12
<i>Medina v. Bauer</i> , 2004 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 910 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 26, 2004).....	13
<i>Midwest Grinding Comp., Inc.</i> , 976 F.2d 1016 (7th Cir. 1992).....	14, 24
<i>Mills v. Polar Molecular Corp.</i> , 12 F.3d 1170 (2d Cir. 1993).....	12
<i>Moll v. US Life Title Insurance Co.</i> , 654 F.Supp. 1012 (S.D.N.Y. 1987).....	19
<i>Moss v. Morgan Stanley Inc.</i> , 719 F.2d 5 (2d Cir. 1983).....	8
<i>Pincay v. Andrews</i> , 238 F.3d 1106 (9th Cir. 2001).....	20
<i>Riverwoods Chappaqua Corp. v. Marine Midland Bank, N.A.</i> , 30 F.3d 399, 344 (2d Cir. 1994).....	17
<i>Rotella v. Wood</i> , 528 U.S. 549 (2000) .....	20
<i>S.Q.K.F.C., Inc. v. Bell Atlantic Tricon Leasing Corp.</i> , 84 F.3d 629 (2d Cir. 1996).....	9
<i>Salinas v. United States</i> , 522 U.S. 52 (1997) .....	21
<i>Schlaifer Nance &amp; Co. v. Estate of Warhol</i> , 119 F.3d 91 (2d Cir. 1997).....	14



<i>Schmidt v. Fleet Bank</i> , 16 F.Supp.2d 340 (S.D.N.Y. 1998) .....	21
<i>Schuh v. Druckman &amp; Sinel, L.L.P.</i> , 2008 WL 542504 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 29, 2008) .....	9, 10
<i>Smith v. Local 819 I.B.T. Pension Plan</i> , 291 F.3d 236 (2d Cir. 2002) .....	7
<i>Sony Music Entertainment, Inc. v. Robison</i> , 2002 WL 272406 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 26, 2002) .....	19
<i>Spool v. World Child Int'l Adoption Agency</i> , 520 F.3d 178 (2d Cir. 2008) .....	12-13
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Eastern Medical, P.C.</i> , 2008 WL 3200256 (E.D.N.Y. Aug. 5, 2008) .....	9
<i>United States v. Gelb</i> , 700 F.2d 875 (2d Cir.), cert. denied, 464 U.S. 853 (1983) .....	9
<i>Vaughn v. Air Line Pilots Association, Intern</i> , 395 B.R. 520 (Bankr. E.D.N.Y. 2008) .....	16
<i>Virtual Countries, Inc. v. Republic of South Africa</i> , 300 F.3d 230 (2d Cir. 2002) .....	7
<i>Wexner v. First Manhattan Co.</i> , 902 F.2d 169 (2d Cir. 1990) .....	12
<i>World Wrestling Entertainment, Inc. v. Jakks Pacific, Inc.</i> , 530 F.Supp.2d 486 (S.D.N.Y. 2007) .....	15

#### STATE CASES

<i>Oswego Laborers' Local 214 Pension Fund v. Marine Midland Bank</i> , 85 N.Y.2d 20 (1995) .....	23
--	----

#### DOCKETED CASES

<i>Pludeman v. Northern Leasing Systems, Inc.</i> , Index No. 101059 (Sup.Ct. N.Y. Co. April 7, 2005) .....	18, 19
<i>Shuh v. Sinel</i> , Docket No. 07 Civ. 0366 (S.D.N.Y. March 19, 2008) .....	11

#### FEDERAL STATUTES

Clayton Act, 15 U.S.C. § 15b.....	20
Fed. R. Civ. P. 9(b).....	3, 9, 12, 13
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) .....	7
Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a).....	24
Hobbs Act, 18 U.S.C. § 1951 .....	1, 4, 14
Racketeering Influenced Corrupt Organizations Act, 18 U.S.C. § 1961(c).....	19
Racketeering Influenced Corrupt Organizations Act, 18 U.S.C. §1962 .....	1
Racketeering Influenced Corrupt Organizations Act, 18 U.S.C. § 1962(d).....	3, 6, 22, 23
Racketeering Influenced Corrupt Organizations Act, 18 U.S.C. § 1964(c).....	4

#### STATE STATUTES

N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 349 .....	1, 23
N.Y. Penal Law § 155.05 .....	1, 4, 13

#### MISCELLANEOUS

<i>Smith &amp; Reed</i> , 1-3 <i>Civil RICO</i> §3.07[2][a] (Matthew Bender 2004).....	18
--	----